

# Development Management Delegated Decision Report

B/20/0282



SUMMARY OF APPLICATION				
<b>Application Reference</b>	B/20/0282			
<b>Application Type</b>	Listed Building Consent			
<b>Proposal</b>	Listed Building Consent for Internal and external alterations consisting of the replacement of kitchen windows, replacement of picture window with doors, removal of one door, and replacement of French doors with a window, and the enlargement of an existing opening in the living room.			
<b>Location</b>	Manor Farm, Burtoft Lane, Wigtoft, Boston, PE20 2PD			
<b>Applicant</b>	Mr B Leggott			
<b>Agent</b>	Mrs Elizabeth Mayle, Liz Mayle Heritage			
<b>Received Date:</b>	03-Aug-2020	<b>Consultation Expiry Date:</b>	04-Sept-2020	
<b>Valid Date:</b>	07-Aug-2020	<b>Statutory Expiry Date:</b>	02-Oct-2020	
<b>Date of Site Visit:</b>	23-Sept-2020	<b>Extension of Time Date:</b>		
<b>Objections received?</b>	No			
<b>5 day notification record:</b>				
	<b>Councillors notified</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Response received – date</b>	<b>Ok to continue</b>
<b>Recommendation</b>	GRANT Listed Building Consent.			
<b>Report by:</b>	Simon Eldred			
<b>Date:</b>	23 <sup>rd</sup> September 2020			



## **OFFICER REPORT**

### **SITE AND SURROUNDINGS:**

The application site is located on the western side of Burtoft Lane, and is a detached listed dwelling in a countryside location. It is predominantly two-storeys in height and white painted, with single-storey side wings and rear extensions, and has been altered and extended from its original form.

### **DETAILS OF PROPOSAL:**

The application seeks listed building consent to:

- paint the brickwork and cladding of a modern two-storey, rear extension to match the remaining building;
- replace two modern windows in the building's northern elevation with white powder-coated, double-glazed units;
- install decorative panels of plaster (to match existing panels in the dining room and hallway) to the ceiling of the living room;
- remove a modern, part-glazed internal screen between the living room extension and hallway, and install a new glazed screen in a location slightly further north;
- install new doors and window in replacement of an existing external picture window, french-doors and a modern timber reproduction door; and
- enlarge an existing opening in the living room by removing an approximately 1m length of internal wall and an approximately 25cm length of a ceiling beam.

### **RELEVANT HISTORY:**

In 2006, listed building consent was granted for

- repairs to dormer window and flat roof, replacement of existing felt and sheet metal with lead (B/06/0036); and
- the replacement of rotten timber french-doors (B/06/0347).

### **RELEVANT DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES AND DOCUMENTS:**

The **South East Lincolnshire Local Plan 2011-2036** shows the application site as being within the Countryside, approximately 800m from the nearest Settlement Boundary (Wigtoft). No specific allocations or designations apply, and Policies of relevance to this proposal are:

- Policy 3: Design of New Development; and
- Policy 29: The Historic Environment.

### **OTHER RELEVANT DOCUMENTS / LEGISLATION / GUIDANCE:**

#### **National Planning Policy Framework (2019)**

At the heart of the 2019 Framework is a presumption in favour of sustainable development. The following sections are relevant to this scheme:

- Section 4: Decision-making; and
- Section 16: Conserving and enhancing the historic environment.

#### **National Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)**

The following categories of the Planning Practice Guidance are relevant to this proposal:

- Determining a planning application; and
- Historic environment.

### **CONSULTATION RESPONSES:**

Heritage Lincolnshire indicates that the building is Grade II listed and that consequently any proposals should not adversely affect its special interest. They indicate that the proposals on the whole are sympathetic to the host building and, in particular, that the elements affecting the more modern extensions will not impact upon the building's special interest. However, they:

- query whether the 1960's fireplace in the living room is proposed for retention;
- query whether the beam in the living room is intended to be clad; and
- indicate that they do not support the proposed removal of an element of walling and the truncation of an original timber beam in the living room, as they consider that these works will adversely affect the listed building's special interest.

Wigtoft Parish Council indicates that it has no comments.

### **THIRD PARTY REPRESENTATIONS RECEIVED:**

No third party representations have been received.

### **EVALUATION:**

Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires a local planning authority to have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest it possesses. This statutory duty sits above the policy objectives identified within the earlier section of this report. In this context, the objective of preservation is to cause no harm, and is a matter of paramount concern in the planning process. Beyond this, where harm would be caused, there is a necessity to establish the extent of that harm, and consider this within the policy context.

In practice, this requires a methodical approach to be followed wherein the relevant assets which would be affected need to be identified, along with their significance. Consideration can then be given to any effects on this significance resulting from the proposals, which may be reduced through mitigation. If harm is identified, it is then required to establish the scale and extent of such harm, before moving on to matters such as the planning balance and weighing the benefits arising against any identified harm.

***Heritage assets affected*** - it is considered that only one heritage asset is potentially affected – Manor Farm itself, which is Grade II listed.

The list description reads *“Farmhouse. Early C18, with minor C19 alterations and C20 extensions. Roughcast rendered brick, slate roof with stone coped gables, 2 partly external brick stacks. 2 storey with garret, 5 bay front having first floor band. Central glazed double doors covered by C20 hipped roofed glazed porch, flanked by pairs of plain sashes. To first floor 5 similar windows. All windows have plain stucco splayed lintels. Interior has stick baluster stair with wreathed handrail.”*

***Impacts of the proposals on this asset*** – The paragraphs that follow examine the proposals one at a time.

It is proposed to paint the two-storey, rear extension onto the living room off-white to match the colour of the majority of the building. This extension dates back to somewhere around 1960 and is constructed in orange brickwork and brown timber-cladding. It is

considered that the proposals will help to minimise the visual impact of the modern extension and better 'tie' it to the remaining house. It is considered that this will have no harmful impact upon the listed building's special interest – a view which is shared by Heritage Lincolnshire.

It is proposed to replace two modern windows in the building's northern (side) elevation with white powder-coated, double-glazed units. These windows are located within a 20<sup>th</sup> Century extension which is not considered to be of special architectural or historic interest. Given that the replacement windows will be virtually identical to the originals in terms of their design and materials, it is considered that these proposals will have no harmful impacts upon the listed building's special interest – a view which is shared by Heritage Lincolnshire.

It is proposed to install three decorative plaster panels to the ceiling of the living room, which will match the design of existing panels in the dining room and hallway. It is considered that these proposals will have no harmful impacts upon the listed building's special interest – a view which is shared by Heritage Lincolnshire.

It is proposed to remove a modern, partially-glazed internal screen between the circa 1960's living room extension and the rear corridor to its north. In its place, a glazed screen is proposed to be installed in a location slightly further north. These proposals do not remove any historic fabric, and the screen which is proposed to be removed is not considered to be of architectural or historic significance. It is considered that these works will have no harmful impacts upon the listed building's special interest – a view which is shared by Heritage Lincolnshire.

It is proposed to remove an existing external picture window, and a modern timber reproduction door which are located on the western elevation of the circa 1960's extension to the living room. They will be replaced with sliding doors of a contemporary design. Existing french-doors on the extension's southern elevation will be replaced by a new window within a reduced opening. The extension is not considered to be of special architectural or historic interest, and the replacement doors/windows represent a relatively minor variation from the originals. It is considered that these proposals will have no harmful impacts upon the listed building's special interest – a view which is shared by Heritage Lincolnshire.

Lastly, it is proposed to remove an approximately 1m length of internal wall and an approximately 25cm length of a ceiling beam from the living room. The removal of the beam and this section of wall will allow the incorporation of space at the end of the rear corridor (created by the 1960's extension) within the living room. The beam and length of wall are historic fabric – they are part of the 18<sup>th</sup> Century original building. Heritage Lincolnshire raises concerns about these proposals on the basis that they will make the original layout of the room less discernible and will adversely affect the special interest of the listed building. In contrast, the Heritage Impact Statement which accompanies the application argues that *"the only original features left in the Living Room of 18<sup>th</sup> C origin is the ceiling beam and the panelled window reveals. All other features it may once have had were removed prior to circa 1960. There is a 19<sup>th</sup> C door between the Living Room and Staircase Hall, the architrave is not original, and the sash windows are four paned 19<sup>th</sup> C in style, rather than Georgian paned windows. Due to the lack of typical 18<sup>th</sup> C form and features, the Living Room is of very limited significance."*

At the site visit, it was apparent that the living room contains almost no original features, and that its original square plan-form has already been lost thanks to the 1960's extension. It is agreed that the proposed works will have harmful impacts upon the listed building's special interest, in that they involve the removal of elements of its historic fabric. However, it is considered that the scale of the historic fabric that will be lost is very small and that this fabric does not amount to 'features of special architectural or historic interest'. Furthermore, it is not agreed that the works will make the room's original layout harder to discern – that layout has already been compromised by the 1960's extension and these works will not worsen matters. As a consequence, it is not considered that the impacts of these proposed works will lead to 'substantial' harm – rather, it is considered that impacts will be 'less than substantial' (in the terminology used in the NPPF). Indeed, bearing in mind the above factors, it is considered that the impacts would be at the very bottom end of the spectrum of 'less than substantial harm'. In such circumstances, the provisions of the NPPF indicate that the *"harm should be weighed against the benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use."* The proposals will allow the incorporation of space at the end of the rear corridor (created by the 1960's extension) within the living room and, whilst these benefits are modest, it is nonetheless considered that they outweigh the very minor harm to the listed building's special interest that would be caused.

Thus, notwithstanding Heritage Lincolnshire's concerns about one element of the proposals, it is considered that they meet the requirements of the NPPF and Policy 29 of the Local Plan.

Heritage Lincolnshire also raised two queries concerning the proposed internal works within the living room, namely they asked:

- whether the 1960's fireplace is proposed to be retained. The agent confirms that the fireplace is to be retained; and
- whether the beam in the living room is intended to be clad. The agent confirms that the beam will not be clad.

### **CONCLUSION:**

It is considered that the majority of the proposals will cause no harm to the listed building's special interest. It is considered that the removal of a length of internal wall and part of a ceiling beam from the living room will cause some harm to the listed building's special interest (albeit impacts that would be very much at the lower end of the spectrum of 'less than substantial harm'). However, it is considered that this harm is outweighed by the benefits that this element of the proposals will deliver. Consequently, it is considered appropriate for listed building consent to be granted.

### **RECOMMENDATION:**

GRANT Listed Building Consent subject to the following conditions and reasons:-

CONDITIONS / REASONS			
Pre-commencement conditions?		Agreed with applicant/agent - Date:	
1. The works must be begun not later than the expiry of three years beginning with the date of this permission.			

Reason: Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 18 of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2. The works hereby permitted shall be carried out in strict accordance with the application received 03-Aug-2020 and in accordance with the associated plans referenced:

- Drawing number 05F – Proposed Plan;
- Drawing number 06H – Proposed Elevations;
- Drawing number 07D – Section as Proposed;
- Drawing number 08 – Proposed Ceiling in Lounge to match Existing Dining/Hall; and
- Drawing number 09B – Proposed Kitchen Windows.

Reason: To ensure the works are undertaken in accordance with the approved details and to accord with Policies 3 and 29 of the South East Lincolnshire Local Plan 2011-2036

**INFORMATIVES / NOTES  
TO BE INCLUDED ON/WITH DECISION NOTICE**

**STATEMENT OF PROACTIVE WORKING:**

In determining this application, the authority has taken account of the guidance in paragraph 38 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 in order to seek to secure sustainable development that improves the economic, social and environmental conditions of the Borough.