

# Development Management Delegated Decision Report

B/20/0250



## SUMMARY OF APPLICATION

<b>Application Reference</b>	B/20/0250		
<b>Application Type</b>	Listed Building Consent		
<b>Proposal</b>	Listed Building Consent for internal and external structural repairs		
<b>Location</b>	Brothertoft Hall, Main Road, Brothertoft, Boston, PE20 3SW		
<b>Applicant</b>	Mr Robinson, C/O Agent		
<b>Agent</b>	Mr J Cook, DesignSpace Architecture Ltd		
<b>Received Date:</b>	14-Jul-2020	<b>Consultation Expiry Date:</b>	11-Aug-2020
<b>Valid Date:</b>	14-Jul-2020	<b>Statutory Expiry Date:</b>	<b>08-Sep-2020</b>
<b>Date of Site Visit:</b>	28-Sept-2020	<b>Extension of Time Date:</b>	<b>23-Oct-2020</b>
<b>Objections received?</b>	No		
<b>5 day notification record:</b>	Not applicable		
<b>Councillors notified</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Response received – date</b>	<b>Ok to continue</b>
<b>Recommendation</b>	GRANT Listed Building Consent.		
<b>Report by:</b>	Simon Eldred		
<b>Date:</b>	15 <sup>th</sup> October 2020		

## OFFICER REPORT

### SITE AND SURROUNDINGS:

The application site is located on the western side of Langrick Road, and contains a detached three-storey listed dwelling and a single-storey outbuilding within a domestic garden. The site is located in the countryside, approximately 300m from the highway, with the Church of St Gilbert approximately 125m to the south-east, and a modern agricultural building approximately 40m to the west.

### DETAILS OF PROPOSAL:

The application seeks listed building consent for structural repairs to rectify damage from recent subsidence. The proposed works comprise:

- taking down and rebuilding an arch within a garden wall, using lime mortar (to match existing) and the existing bricks and coping stones;
- cutting out bricks in patches not exceeding 10 bricks above a door opening in the northern elevation of the outbuilding, and replacing bricks like-for-like in size, colour and texture with mortar to match existing, and inserting Helibars into mortar beds;
- cutting out bricks in patches not exceeding 10 bricks in the corner of an office within the outbuilding, replacing bricks like-for-like in size, colour and texture, and making good plaster;



- cutting out bricks in patches not exceeding 10 bricks in the western elevation of the house, and replacing bricks like-for-like in size, colour and texture with mortar to match existing, and inserting Helibars into mortar beds;
- removing Lincrusta wallpaper from the cracked walls of the house's internal staircase, making good the plasterwork, and redecorating with matching Lincrusta wallpaper;
- cutting back the render to a minimum of 75mm on either side of a crack in the corner of a ground-floor room within the house, raking out fractured mortar bed joints, wedging and repointing with a mortar to match existing, fitting a mesh, rendering and plastering; and
- cutting back the render to a minimum of 75mm on either side of a crack in the corner of a first-floor room within the house, raking out fractured mortar bed joints, wedging and repointing with a mortar to match existing, fitting a mesh, rendering and plastering.

### **RELEVANT HISTORY:**

In 2014, listed building consent (B/14/0178) was granted for the re-rendering of the rear elevation.

### **RELEVANT DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES AND DOCUMENTS:**

The **South East Lincolnshire Local Plan 2011-2036** shows the application site as being within the Countryside, just over 1km from the nearest Settlement Boundary (Langrick Bridge). No specific allocations or designations apply, and Policies of relevance to this proposal are:

- Policy 3: Design of New Development; and
- Policy 29: The Historic Environment.

### **OTHER RELEVANT DOCUMENTS / LEGISLATION / GUIDANCE:**

#### **National Planning Policy Framework (2019)**

At the heart of the 2019 Framework is a presumption in favour of sustainable development. The following sections are relevant to this scheme:

- Section 4: Decision-making; and
- Section 16: Conserving and enhancing the historic environment.

#### **National Planning Practice Guidance (PPG)**

The following categories of the Planning Practice Guidance are relevant to this proposal:

- Determining a planning application; and
- Historic environment.

### **CONSULTATION RESPONSES:**

**Holland Fen with Brothertoft Parish Council** indicates that it has no objections to the application.

**Heritage Lincolnshire** identifies that the proposals affect a grade II listed building and must not affect its special interest. They indicate that, whilst the information supplied clearly demonstrates the need for substantial repair, it does not demonstrate that some aspects of the proposals will not have a detrimental impact upon the listed building's character and appearance, namely:

- the methods to be used to rake out the joints and to fix the helibars;
- whether the proposed mortar is appropriate; and
- whether the wall covering on the staircase is Lincrusta wallpaper or panelling.

### **THIRD PARTY REPRESENTATIONS RECEIVED:**

A member of Holland Fen with Brothertoft Parish Council indicates that they are unable to make any comment, given that they find it difficult to access information via the Borough Council's website.

### **EVALUATION:**

Section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires a local planning authority to have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest it possesses. This statutory duty sits above the policy objectives identified within the earlier section of this report. In this context, the objective of preservation is to cause no harm, and is a matter of paramount concern in the planning process. Beyond this, where harm would be caused, there is a necessity to establish the extent of that harm, and consider this within the policy context.

In practice, this requires a methodical approach to be followed wherein the relevant assets which would be affected need to be identified, along with their significance. Consideration can then be given to any effects on this significance resulting from the proposals, which may be reduced through mitigation. If harm is identified, it is then required to establish the scale and extent of such harm, before moving on to matters such as the planning balance and weighing the benefits arising against any identified harm.

#### ***Heritage assets affected***

It is considered that two heritage assets are potentially affected. Firstly, Brothertoft Hall, which is a Grade II listed building. The list description reads:

*"House. c.1780, substantially extended and altered c.1850. Yellow brick, partly colourwashed and rendered. Hipped slate roof, red brick wall stacks. 3 storey, 5 bay front, the side elevations are canted bays. C19 rendered additions to rear and ground floor comprising central panelled doors with overlight flanked by single fixed lights set in canted porch. To either side are single large flat roofed canted bay windows, glazing bar sashes to each face. The 2 upper floors each have 5 glazing bar sashes with segmental brick heads. The house was reputedly built out of the profits from cultivating woad."*

Secondly, Brothertoft Hall potentially forms part of the setting to another nearby listed building, namely the Grade II Church of St Gilbert. The building is located approximately 125m to the Hall's south-east.

#### ***Impacts of the proposals on these assets***

It is considered that the proposed internal works may potentially impact on the significance only of Brothertoft Hall (i.e. they have no implications for the setting of the Church of St Gilbert). These proposed works involve:

- cutting out bricks in patches not exceeding 10 bricks in the corner of an office within the outbuilding, replacing bricks like-for-like in size, colour and texture, and making good plaster;
- cutting back the render to a minimum of 75mm on either side of a crack in the corner of a ground-floor room within the house, raking out fractured mortar bed joints, wedging and

repointing with a mortar to match existing, fitting a mesh, and rendering and plastering; and

- cutting back the render to a minimum of 75mm on either side of a crack in the corner of a first-floor room within the house, raking out fractured mortar bed joints, wedging and repointing with a mortar to match existing, fitting a mesh, and rendering and plastering.

The site visit confirmed that the internal walls of these rooms have suffered significant cracking - the proposed works seek to repair this damage. It is considered that the proposed works will have no harmful impacts upon the listed building's special interest, a view which is shared by Heritage Lincolnshire.

One further element of internal work initially concerned Heritage Lincolnshire (the removal and replacement of wallpaper from the cracked walls of the house's internal staircase) causing them to comment that *"there is little information on the lincrusta wallpaper ... further information needs to be provided to ensure that this area is definitely lincrusta and not panelling, as appears in the images."* The site visit confirmed that the walls of the staircase are covered in a wallpaper which mimics wooden panelling, and the agent indicates that it has been identified as being produced by Lincrusta. The existing wallpaper has been torn by the cracking of the plaster beneath, and it is considered that the proposed works will have no harmful impacts upon the listed building's special interest, a view now shared by Heritage Lincolnshire.

The proposed external works have the potential to impact not just on the significance of Bothertoft Hall, but also on the setting of the Church of St Gilbert. These proposed changes involve:

- taking down and rebuilding an arch within a garden wall, using lime mortar (to match existing) and the existing bricks and coping stones;
- cutting out bricks in patches not exceeding 10 bricks above a door opening in the northern elevation of the outbuilding, and replacing bricks like-for-like in size, colour and texture with mortar to match existing and inserting Helibars into mortar beds; and
- cutting out bricks in patches not exceeding 10 bricks in the western elevation of the house, and replacing bricks like-for-like in size, colour and texture with mortar to match existing and inserting Helibars into mortar beds.

Looking first at potential impacts on the nearby listed Church's setting. It is considered that, because the proposed works are very modest in their scale and affect elements of Brothertoft Hall which have no visual connection with the Church, no harm will be caused to the Church's setting.

Turning to the potential impacts on Brothertoft Hall:

- the site visit confirmed that the arch within the garden wall has suffered significant cracking - the proposed works seek to repair this damage. The repairs involve the re-use of the existing bricks and coping stones. Subject to a condition to ensure that the mortar used will match that used in the remainder of the wall, it is considered that the proposed works will have no harmful impacts upon the listed building's special interest, a view which is shared by Heritage Lincolnshire; and
- the site visit confirmed that the northern elevation of the outbuilding and the western elevation of the house have suffered significant cracking – the works seek to repair this damage. Heritage Lincolnshire initially expressed concerns that insufficient information had been provided concerning: the methods to be used to chase out mortar joints and to fix Helibars; and the mortar mix that would be used. Although additional information from the agent indicated that mortar joints would be chased out with a mechanical saw, and

that the helibars would then be inserted within a resin and covered with mortar, it is considered that this does not provide adequate certainty about the proposals. Consequently it is considered necessary for conditions to be imposed to ensure that: the proposed method for chasing out the mortar joints will not widen the joints; and the mortar used will match that used in the remainder of the walls. Subject to these conditions, it is considered that these aspects of the proposed works will have no harmful impact on the listed building's special interest. Furthermore, it is considered to be necessary to impose a condition to ensure that any replacement bricks used in the northern elevation of the outbuilding and the western elevation of the house will match those in the existing walls in terms of their size, colour and texture.

## **CONCLUSION:**

It is considered that the proposals will cause no harm to the setting of the nearby listed Church of St Gilbert. Furthermore it is considered that, subject to conditions to control the detailed methodology of some of the works and the materials to be used, the proposals will cause no harm to the special interest of Brothertoft Hall itself.

## **RECOMMENDATION:**

GRANT Listed Building Consent subject to the following conditions and reasons:-

<b>CONDITIONS / REASONS</b>	
Pre-commencement conditions?	Yes    Agreed with applicant/agent - Date:    Yes – 15/10
1	<p>The works must be begun not later than the expiry of three years beginning with the date of this permission.</p> <p><b>Reason:</b> Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 18 of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.</p>
2	<p>The works hereby permitted shall be carried out in strict accordance with the application received 14-Jul-2020 and in accordance with the associated documents referenced:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Drawing number 001 – Survey;</li> <li>• Drawing number 002 – Survey; and</li> <li>• Drawing number 003 Revision A – Proposals.</li> </ul> <p><b>Reason:</b> To ensure the works are undertaken in accordance with the approved details and to accord with Policies 3 and 29 of the South East Lincolnshire Local Plan 2011-2036.</p>
3	<p>Before the proposals affecting the northern elevation of the outbuilding and the western elevation of the house are carried out, a sample of the chasing of mortar joints shall be prepared for inspection and approval in writing by the Local Planning Authority. All chasing out of mortar joints shall match the approved sample.</p> <p><b>Reason:</b> To ensure the use of appropriate materials which are sympathetic to the character of the Grade II Listed Brothertoft Hall, the outbuilding and garden wall in accordance with Policy 29 of the South East Lincolnshire Local Plan 2011-2036.</p>

4	<p>Before the garden wall, the northern elevation of the outbuilding and the western elevation of the house are re-mortared, (a) sample panel(s) of the mortar(s) to be used shall be prepared on site for inspection and approval in writing by the Local Planning Authority. All re-mortaring shall match the approved panel(s).</p> <p><b>Reason:</b> To ensure the use of appropriate materials which are sympathetic to the character of the Grade II Listed Brothertoft Hall, the outbuilding and garden wall in accordance with Policy 29 of the South East Lincolnshire Local Plan 2011-2036.</p>
---	---

INFORMATIVES / NOTES TO BE INCLUDED ON/WITH DECISION NOTICE	
<p><u>STATEMENT OF PROACTIVE WORKING:</u></p> <p>In determining this application, the authority has taken account of the guidance in paragraph 38 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 in order to seek to secure sustainable development that improves the economic, social and environmental conditions of the Borough.</p>	